## Historic Properties Survey Peach's Point, Naugus Head and West Shore Neighborhoods Final Report September, 2022

John D. Clemson with Neil Larson and Claire W. Dempsey

### Abstract

This project completed an intensive-level survey of historic resources within the Peach's Point, Naugus Head and West Shore neighborhoods. These areas were identified for survey in order to expand upon the Coastal Zone phase of survey completed in 2016 by documenting associated additional resources located inland of the coastal zone as outlined in the Marblehead Community-Wide Historic Preservation Survey Master Plan (Survey Plan) completed by Larson Fisher Associates in July of 2014 and scope of work for this project. Peach's Point was identified with the resort era of the decades bracketing 1900 and is characterized by large, elaborate seasonal cottages developed for a regional and national elite. The other two areas, however, served the same function for an emerging class of local workers and tradesman who built much simpler "camps" for summer recreation.

A major goal of this project was to document these recreational resources, which are rapidly disappearing or undergoing profound change. Because so few of them survive, a determination was made in the early phases of this project to supplement their study by documenting later phases of year-round development that took place on a large scale in this area characterized as "bedroom communities." Two area forms, Ocean Park and Porter's Beach, document both phases of this landscape: resort and residential; a third, Beacon Heights, focused on a large, intact, well-preserved post-war residential subdivision. The few earliest surviving resort-era resources in Peach's Point and Naugus Head were recorded individually. This project also identified several rare-surviving resources from the town's Colonial and 19<sup>th</sup> century periods associated with agriculture in each neighborhood. Finally, individual institutional or recreational resources, including a school, a cemetery and a playground were documented as part of this project.

#### **Survey Objectives**

This project was initially designed to focus on four neighborhoods identified in the Marblehead Community-Wide Historic Preservation Survey Master Plan (Survey Plan) completed by Larson Fisher Associates in July of 2014: Peach's Point, Naugus Head, West Shore and Preston Beach. Because the suggested target list for survey in the RFQ's scope of work and Survey Plan identified over 700 resources for potential documentation, an initial decision was taken by the consulting team to recommend postponing Preston Beach, which is located far from the other areas in the southwest quadrant of the Marblehead peninsula and differs from the others in terms of character and history. The Marblehead LPC was consulted and generally agreed that it made sense to postpone survey in Preston Beach at the time. The three remaining areas are geographically contiguous, wrapping the north and west edges of the Marblehead peninsula. They are generally related historically, each with resources from Marblehead's colonial agricultural and resort era, better lending them to more efficient documentation.

Each of these three neighborhoods underwent partial survey during the initial phase of work which took place in 2015-2016 identified as the Coastal Zone. At that time, survey was limited to properties within a specified narrow distance from the coast, generally dating to the town's late-19<sup>th</sup> through early 20<sup>th</sup> century resort era. This year's phase of work recorded additional properties and areas near the Coastal Zone but also those that are located farther inland. It expanded into earlier periods of the Colonial and 19<sup>th</sup> century related to early agricultural activities

within the town. More recent periods related to the town's emergence as a commuter suburb during the 20<sup>th</sup> century were also recorded.

### **Start-up Meeting**

Clemson, Dempsey, Larson, Steinitz Stott and Franklin held a conference call on December 3, 2021 to launch this project. The discussion noted the late start for the project, and the consultants suggested they would provide a new schedule of phase dates for the project with a target of late mid-to-late January for the completion of Phases I and II, which would be combined, and that sample forms were not necessary. It was also noted that the suggested scope of work in the RFQ listed a number of properties which far exceeded the budget for this project. The consultants suggested the following approach.

Despite delays related to the recent pandemic, the consulting team endeavored to complete the project as close to schedule as possible. This report and the fourth phase of product marks the completion of the project by late September of 2022.

#### Selection criteria

The consultant team began by reviewing preliminary research on historic subdivision plans cited in the 2014 Survey Plan to identify coherent areas within each neighborhood that could be recorded within the project's budget. Priorities were placed on the earliest surviving and highest-integrity resources. A small number of agriculture-associated 18<sup>th</sup> through early 19<sup>th</sup> century resources were identified in each neighborhood. Another priority was resort-era resources that lie near or inland of the Coastal Zone areas previously recorded during 2015-2016. A third priority was the earliest residential subdivisions established and developed during the inter-war period of the 1920s-1930s as the town evolved into a bedroom suburb. It was also possible to include a number of Post-war resources which developed on either formerly agricultural- or resort-use land. Finally other types of resources in public ownership such as the Village School, Waterside Cemetery and Gerry Playground were identified for documentation.

Preliminary observations determined that each of the three places that became the focus of this project underwent extensive recent development on formerly open land or extensive alterations of individual buildings, many formerly seasonal camps from the resort era or smaller year-round housing from the suburban era, or their outright replacement. The extent of recent development and the amount of alteration posed a challenge to organizing recording methods for this project. The focus, however, remained on the earliest and highest-integrity buildings and areas within each of these places.

As initial Phase III work progressed, including field observations and preliminary research using current assessor's records, large numbers of buildings proposed for survey in the Naugus Head neighborhood were found to have been demolished and replaced or of recent construction. Alternatives were developed to record more-recent mid-20<sup>th</sup>-century subdivisions that nevertheless retained high degrees of integrity. The most intact mid-century subdivision, known as Beacon Heights, was therefore substituted for Naugus Head. Two other subdivisions that retain some resources from the resort and inter-war eras were also recorded: Ocean Park and Porter's Beach.

### **Procedures followed in the survey**

The suggested scope of work included with the RFQ for this project exceeded 700 properties. These suggestions were derived from the 2014 Survey Plan. The total budget of \$40,000 for this project aimed to record 150 properties. The scope also included illustrated Powerpoint presentations outlining the development history of

each place: Peach's Point, Naugus Head and West Shore; which had to be accounted for in the budget. Administrative tasks have also been accounted for.

Because Phases I and II were combined, the following outline combined an assessment of existing documentation with recommendations for survey for each of the three places identified as Peach's Point, Naugus Head and West Shore. With the exception of Peach's Point, which is further explained below, the nature of the resources located in the other two places consist of large numbers of altered resort-era camps and 20<sup>th</sup> century residential subdivisions. Therefore a determination was made that they would be most efficiently recorded using area forms. Early in the project it was suggested that traditional data sheets would be used there, but as research and work progressed, it was found that the high numbers and uniformity of those resources would be more efficiently recorded using the expanded data sheets with individual photographs combined with descriptive and historical data. These recording methods are familiar to the local and state commissions through their use in previous phases of survey in Marblehead and elsewhere.

Research for the smaller number of individual forms followed the standard methodology set forth in the "Historic Properties Survey Manual" issued and updated by the Massachusetts Historical Commission. The process included field inspection and photography, archival research, association with architectural and historical contexts, and assessment of significance. Research sources included historic atlases, city directories, the U.S. Federal Census, genealogical sources, and the digital copies of the *Boston Globe* and other newspapers. Public buildings underwent additional research through the records of the Department of Public Safety in the collections of the Massachusetts State archives. Local history sources were searched in local repositories and on the Internet using Google Books and the Internet Archive. Biographical information on architects and builders and property owners and occupants were gathered from architectural records, newspaper accounts, obituaries and genealogical sources and indexes, including sources was to focus on collected primary sources, like vital records, land and probate records, and to approach compiled genealogical work with a skeptical eye. Similarly, secondary sources were reviewed for the reliability and quality of their research, and unreferenced publications were used with caution.

### Peach's Point (see 2014 Survey Plan, Appendix III, p. 26)

The team initially refined the selection process here by checking assessor's dates to eliminate the predominance of recent buildings. Because the west section of Peach's Point, roughly between the main point to the east and Cloutman's Point to the west along the north side of Beacon Street, did not generally develop until after the middle of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, a determination was made to record individually the remaining 13 surviving resources from the resort era. Most of the remaining properties in this area date to the 1980s through 2000s with only a few exceptions as early as 1950. A decision was made that this many recent buildings did not warrant recordation using an area form as was previously recommended. This resulted in a strategy that differs somewhat from that outlined in the scope, which had proposed a single large area for the majority of the neighborhood defined by ownership by the Crowninshield family. During the Coastal Zone phase of 2015-2016 the eastern section of the area, where the greatest number of early resources are located, was recorded as an area (MAR.AN) and the remaining resources to the west close to the coast were recorded individually (MAR.1394-1399).

Properties recorded using B forms (from rfq and survey plan, verified against assessor's dates, removing properties already surveyed or demolished):

Beacon Street 76, 81, 99 (barn), 100 Bradlee Road 10, 11, 17, 21, 29, 32 Captains Walk Lane 7

Mill Pond 2 Mooring Road 6



Survey Plan map depicting Peach's Point. Note the absence of planned subdivisions. Preliminary research of assessor's records indicated that many buildings in the area date to post-1950 and that Resort Era resources are scattered, resulting in the final approach to record selective resources individually.



MACRIS Map of Peach's Point showing previous survey.

### Naugus Head (see 2014 Survey Plan, Appendix III, p. 21)

## Recent Survey: MAR.AL (15 properties) and MAR.1334, 1338, 1342, 1343, 1345

With few exceptions this neighborhood is characterized by subdivisions of the inter- and post-war periods, though much of the southeast section was apparently subdivided later during recent decades (subdivision #7, Schooner Ridge, #8, Whittier Road, and #9, Beacon Hill Road). Initial review of the recommendations and assessments from the Survey Plan suggested that this phase of research focus on inter-war subdivisions, which would also build on research from the Coastal Zone Survey. The numbers refer to subdivisions identified in the 2014 Survey Plan in Appendix III, p. 21.

Although Naugus Head was subdivided as early as 1908, preliminary research and fieldwork revealed that a predominance of the buildings in the area (#s 1, Naugus Head; 4, Pittman Field; and 6, Edgemere, in the Survey Plan depicted below) date from recent decades or have been heavily altered and that the small number of early 20<sup>th</sup> century cottages thought to have survived have only recently been torn down for replacement by new buildings.

Observation of the 1912 Walker atlas of Marblehead and the 1949 Sanborn map of the area determined that by the later date approximately 50 cottages and a radio station building had been built east of Green Street on Naugus, Sparhawk, John's and Intervale. Subsequent preliminary research and field observation suggested **only 6 survive, 4 of which have undergone profound alteration**. Pittman Field has few undocumented buildings dating to before World War II, and the remaining undocumented buildings in Edgemere were built during since 1950 or during recent decades.

### The following areas, initially proposed for survey, were recommended for postponement:

Pittman Field (#4)	SED Plan 46:26	Approximately 20 properties
Edgemere (#6)	SED Plan 55:84	Approximately 20 properties
Naugus Head (#1)	SED Plan 17:6	Approximately 50 properties

#### The following area was substituted for the three areas above:

Preliminary fieldwork and research determined that what was initially identified as the Courtis Estate (#3) plan 76:12 (1947), 237 of 1947, 372 of 1947 and 4086:241 (1954) is a cohesive, well-preserved subdivision built rapidly between 1950 and 1970 with a small number from the late 1940s. Subsequent research identified the developers and their name for the subdivision as **Beacon Heights**, which was recorded as part of this project using the expanded data sheet format. The area includes approximately 81 properties.

The following Individual forms were documented in order to capture surviving agricultural and resort-era buildings in Beacon Heights and Naugus Head:

Cloutman's Lane 13	ca. 1865
Green Street 166	ca. 1750
Green Street 214	ca. 1700
Sparhawk Ter. 5	ca. 1924
Sparhawk Ter. 12	ca. 1927



Survey Plan map depicting Naugus Head. The recorded subdivision plans referenced above are outlined in red and the corresponding numbers refer to the areas described above. Beacon Heights is depicted as subdivision #3.



MACRIS map of Naugus Head showing previous survey.

West Shore (see 2014 Survey Plan, Appendix III, p. 33)

Recent Survey: MAR.AM (6 properties) and MAR.AO (24 properties)

With few exceptions, remaining un-surveyed sections this neighborhood are characterized by subdivisions of the inter- and post-war periods. Initial review of the recommendations and assessments from the 2014 Survey Plan suggested that this phase of research focus on inter-war subdivisions in this neighborhood as well. Preliminary research found that three subdivisions included a mix of early 20<sup>th</sup> century resort era cottages, inter-war, and post-war in-fill. One, Bayview Park (#8), was found to have undergone substantial loss of integrity with regard to its resort era resources and that much of its infill was post-war or more recent.

Two other areas were found to retain greater integrity and cohesion as well as greater numbers of resort era resources:

Harris Beach (#10), aka Porter's Beach	SED Plan 54:62 (1928) 59 properties
Ocean Park (#11)	SED Plan 35:35 (1921) 123 properties.

Both Porter's Beach and Ocean Park contain a diversity of resources from the late resort and suburban eras, so a determination was made to employ extended data sheets here.



Survey Plan depicting West Shore. Recorded subdivision plans are outlined in red. Porter's Beach is identified by the number 10 and Ocean Park by number 11.



MACRIS map showing part of West Shore of the south half with previous survey.

## Individual forms

Manataug Trail 11, Harris Farm (continuation sheet)	ca. 1720
Stramski Way 0, Gerry Playground	1968
Village Street 93, Marblehead Junior High School	1953
Waterside Road 50-52, Looney House and Barn	18th century
West Shore Drive 294, Waterside Cemetery	1859

## **PROPERTIES SURVEYED:**

23 individual forms

# 263 in three areas

## TOTAL

286

### The amount and kinds of information gathered about the properties

The survey documentation was recorded on current MHC forms, including B forms and a small group of extended-data-sheet Area forms. These forms included:

- An exterior architectural description augmented by photographs.
- A narrative history of the construction and social history of the building or area including background information on owners, major tenants, architects, and builders.
- Bibliographic references specific to the property.
- Scans of historic photographs found in archival research were appended where available, as well as copies of historic maps in examples where clarifying evidence was important.
- Location maps include parcel lines and building footprints and show at least one cross-street.

## **Street Index of Inventoried Properties**

MHC#	NO.	STREET	PARCEL #	NAME	DATE
MAR.BI				Beacon Heights	1946-1970
MAR.BJ				Ocean Park	
MAR.BK				Porter's Beach	1897-2022
MAR.2469	76	Beacon Street	185-6	Aldrich Carriage House	Ca. 1916
MAR.1025	81	Beacon Street	189-4	Mark Pitman House	Prior to 1796
MAR.2470	99	Beacon Street	190-1	Hawkes Barn and Blanchard House	Pre 1850
MAR.2471					1965
MAR.2472	100	Beacon Street	183-5A	Benjamin Hawkes Tenant House	1850-1872
MAR.2473	10	Bradlee Road	193-13	Crowninshield Tenant – Giles House	1912-1926
MAR.2474	11	Bradlee Road	193-4	Florence W. Marks House	Ca. 1910
MAR.2475	17	Bradlee Road	193-2	Bowdoin Bradlee and Priscilla J. Crowninshield House	1905-1912
MAR.2476	21	Bradlee Road	191-5	Crowninshield Tenant Cottage "Orchard"	1912-1926
MAR.2477	29	Bradlee Road	191-4	Crowninshield – Chesterton House	1912-1926
MAR.2478	32	Bradlee Road	191-2	Crowninshield – Valentine Tenant House	1897-1912
MAR.2479	7	Captain's Walk Lane	181-4	Robert E. and Elizabeth P. Peabody House	Ca. 1930
MAR.2480	13	Cloutman's Lane	174-41	John S. and Sarah B. Tutt House	Ca. 1865
MAR.2481	166	Green Street	159-2	Harris – Courtis House	Ca. 1750
MAR.2482	214	Green Street	158-24	Girdler – Sparhawk – Doliber House	Ca. 1700
MAR.1235	11	Manataug Trail	123-22	Harris Farm	18 <sup>th</sup> C
MAR.2483	2	Mill Pond	185-5	Batchelder House	Ca. 1937
MAR.2484	6	Mooring Road	191-7	Crowninshield Tenant Cottage	1912-1926
MAR.2485	5	Sparhawk Terrace	178-9	John W. and Susan S. Gauss Cottage	Ca. 1924
MAR.2486	12	Sparhawk Terrace	177-35	George A. and Maud T. Clark Cottage	Ca. 1927
MAR.952	0	Stramski Way	154-16	Gerry Playground and Stramski House	1950/1968
MAR.2487					
MAR.2488	93	Village Street	119-1	Marblehead Junior High School	1953
MAR.2489	50-	Waterside Road	142-3	Bowen – Hawkes – Looney House and	18 <sup>th</sup> C
MAR.2490	52		142-3A	Barn	
MAR.2491					
MAR.803	294	West Shore Drive	142-1	Waterside Cemetery	1859-present
MAR.2492			142-4	-	-
MAR.2493			143-1		
MAR.2494			143-2		
MAR.956			156-1		
MAR.957					

(A list that provides all MHC numbers used for this project and their addresses, including those recorded in area forms, will be included with the final product.)

## National Register contexts and recommendations for nominations to the NRHP

Although this year's phase of survey documented a large number of buildings which will provide a deeper understanding of Marblehead's early agricultural, resort era, and commuter suburb eras of development, much of what was recorded was found to be either too dispersed to be listed as districts or lacked enough integrity or significance to meet eligibility at this time. One early resource that was found to be a key property in understanding the land use history of Naugus Head was identified for recommendation: the <u>Harris-Courtis House</u>, <u>166 Green</u> <u>Street, ca. 1750</u>. One other resource that was revisited at this time to expand upon its documentary history and recent physical changes was previously listed as part of the First Period Buildings of Eastern Massachusetts TRA (3/9/1990): <u>Harris Farm, 11 Manataug Trail, ca. 1720</u>.

### **Further Study Recommendations**

The Phase I and II report for this project identified subdivisions in Naugus Head and West Shore which are either more recent or retain less integrity so were postponed. However some of these subdivisions will be worthy of documentation in time or as budget allows. Specifically Bayview Park (#8 from the 2014 Survey Plan) will provide further insight into each of the eras investigated during the current phase: Colonial/ agricultural; resort era; and commuter suburb.

Preston Beach, which had to be postponed during this phase of survey would also contribute to a deeper understanding of each of these eras and would expand upon previous survey efforts in the Coastal Zone and Clifton in that area of the Marblehead peninsula.

## **Repositories of Survey Materials**

The products of this survey will be made available to the public at the Marblehead Historical Commission, Abbot Hall, 188 Washington St., Marblehead, open to the public from 9:00 AM - 12:00 Pm, Mon-Fri or by appointment. They will also be on file at the Massachusetts Historical Commission, 220 Morrissey Blvd., Boston MA 02125 and in the Massachusetts Cultural Resource Information System, http://mhc-macris.net/.

## Bibiography

Town Repositories

Abbot Public Library. Marblehead Room Local History Collection & vertical files. Marblehead Assessor's Office. Maps and Property Data. http://marblehead.patriotproperties.com Marblehead Engineering Department. Interactive parcel map. http://marblehead.org/webgis/. Marblehead Engineering Department. Subdivision maps Marblehead Town Clerk. Town records and reports. Marblehead Historical Commission. Records & Archives. www.marbleheadhistory.org. Marblehead Museum & Historical Society. Historical Collections & Archives.

Other Repositories

Boston MA. State Archives. Dept. of Public Safety, Div. of Inspection, Plan Record cards and plans.

Boston MA. Massachusetts Historical Commission. Marblehead Reconnaissance Survey Town Report, Marblehead inventory forms filed in the Inventory of Historic and Archeological Assets of the Commonwealth, National Register of Historic Places nomination forms and vertical files pertaining to Marblehead. Marblehead MA. Shipyard Association.

Salem MA. Peabody Essex Institute. Library and archives; on-line sources

\_\_\_\_\_. Southern Essex District Registry of Deeds

Historic Maps

Coast of New Hampshire and Massachusetts from Great Boars Head to Marblehead Harbor. Joseph F.W. Des Barres, 1776.

*Chart of the Harbors of Salem, Marblehead, Beverly and Manchester, Nathaniel Bowditch, 1806. Map of Marblehead, Massachusetts, State of Massachusetts, 1795.* 

[Map of] The County of Essex. John G. Hales, 1825.

Map of Marblehead, Massachusetts, State of Massachusetts, 1830.

Plan of Marblehead, Massachusetts. Henry McIntyre, 1850.

A Topographical Map of Essex County, Massachusetts. Henry F. Walling, 1856.

Atlas of Essex County, Massachusetts. NY: D.G. Beers & Co., 1872.

[Bird's Eye View of] Marblehead. Boston: M.H. Graves, 1882.

Atlas of Essex County, Massachusetts. Boston: Geo. H. Walker, 1884.

Map of Essex County. Geo. H. Walker, 1891.

Atlas of Marblehead, Massachusetts. Boston: Walker Lithograph & Publishing Co., 1912.

Sanborn Maps of Marblehead, 1885, 1890, 1896, 1901, 1908, 1915, 1926 and 1949.

Published Sources

Aldrich, William Truman. An Architectural Monograph on Marblehead. St. Paul MN: White Pine Bureau, 1918.

Arlington, Benjamin F. Municipal History of Essex County in Massachusetts. 2 volumes. 1922.

Brown, Frank Chouteau. Old Marblehead, Massachusetts. 1915

Bullard, F.L. Historic Summer Haunts from Newport to Portland. 1912.

Chadwick, John. "Marblehead." Harpers 49:289 (June 1874).

- Chase, Mary Ellen. The Fishing Fleets of New England. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1961.
- Cummings, Abbott Lowell. *The Framed Houses of Massachusetts Bay, 1625-1725.* Cambridge MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1979.
- Fogle, Lauren. Colonial Marblehead. Charleston SC: History Press, 2008.
- Hammond, Bill. "The History of Marblehead's Shipyard." Shipyard Association Cookbook. n.d.

Hawthorne, Hildegarde. Old Seaport Towns of New England. 1916.

Hercher, Gail B. Victorian Marblehead. Marblehead MA: Sometime Press, 1980.

Herman, Bernard L. "Smaller Urban Houses of the North Shore, 1630-1830. Kenneth A. Breisch & Alison M. Hoagland, eds., *Building Environments: Perspectives in Vernacular Architecture X.* Knoxville TN: University of Tennessee Press, 2005, 3-14.

- Heyrman, Christine Leigh. Commerce and Culture: The Maritime Communities of Colonial Massachusetts 1690-1750. NY: W.W. Norton & Co., 1984.
- Hurd, D. Hamilton. History of Essex County, Massachusetts. 2 volumes. 1888.

Lacock, John K. Marblehead: The Historic Landmarks and Points of Interest and How to See Them. 1929.

- Lindsay, Benjamin J. Old Marblehead Sea Captains and the Ships in Which They Sailed. Marblehead: Marblehead Historical Society, 1915.
- Lord, Priscilla S. and Virginia C. Gamage. *Marblehead, The Spirit of '76 Lives Here*, Updated Version, Radnor PA: Chilton Book Co., 1972.
- Morison, Samuel Eliot. Builders of the Bay Colony. 1936.

\_. The Maritime History of Massachusetts 1783-1860. Boston: Northeastern University Press,

# 1961.

Newhall, James R. History of Lynn, Essex County, Mass., including Lynnfield, Saugus, Swampscott and Nahant. 1883.

Perley, Sidney. Marblehead in the Year 1700. Salem: Essex Institute, 1910.

\_\_\_\_\_. The Facts of Essex County, Mass. 1889.

\_\_\_\_. The History of Salem Massachusetts, Vol. I. 1924

Randall, Peter E. Salem and Marblehead. Camden ME: Down East Books, 1983.

Roads, Samuel, Jr. The History and Traditions of Marblehead. 1880.

\_\_\_\_. A Guide to Marblehead. 1887.

Robinson, Joseph S. The Story of Marblehead. 1936.

The Marblehead Centennial Almanac. 1876.

Vaughn, Alden T. New England Frontier: Puritans and Indians 1620-1675. Boston: Little Brown, 1970.

Webber, C.H. and W.S. Nevins. Old Naumkeag: A Historical Sketch of the City of Salem and the Towns of

Marblehead, Peabody, Beverly, Danvers, Wenham, Manchester, Topsfield and Middleton. 1877.

Wise, DeWitt D. Now, Then Baker's Island. Salem MA: Baker's Island Associations Inc., 1964.

Woodcock, Sue Ellen. Marblehead, Then & Now, Charleston SC: Arcadia Press, 2002.

Digital Sources

Ancestry.com. federal and state censuses, local directories, birth, death, burial, & military records, genealogies. Google Books.

Marblehead timeline. http://legendinc.com/Pages/MarbleheadNet/MM/Articles/Timeline.html.